Sample Expert Grading Parameters

These are examples of the anchored scales Validated Claim Support expert graders use. Efficacy attributes are scored on 10-point ordinal scales (0 to 9), with a written description at the positive and negative end of each scale so every grader scores against the same reference points. Tolerance and assay scales use the grades shown. The final parameters and scales for each study are set in its protocol, and other parameters, industry scales or client-provided scales can be used on request.

Face and Body

Parameter	Positive anchor	Negative anchor
Fine Lines and Wrinkles (Global)	None	Numerous, deep wrinkles
Skin Texture: Smoothness	Smooth, even surface appearance	Rough, uneven surface appearance
Skin Texture: Softness	Smooth, soft surface feel	Rough, coarse surface feel
Firmness	Firm, tight appearance	Loose appearance
Elasticity	Good stretch and recoil properties	Poor stretch and recoil properties
Suppleness	Pliable, bouncy, supple appearance and feel	Rigid, stiff appearance and feel
Contours	Plump, full cheek contour	Hollow, concave cheek contour
Plumpness	Filled, smooth, firm appearance	Thin, loose appearance
Neck: Horizontal Lines and Wrinkles	None	Numerous deep lines and wrinkles
Sagging (Mid Face)	Taut, “awake”	Sagging, “tired”
Under Eye Bags	None, smooth appearance under eye	Severe, pronounced bags, puffy appearance
Pore Appearance	Small, not easily visible	Large, easily visible
Shine	Matte, velvety appearance	Shiny, slick appearance
Overall Skin Quality and Healthy Appearance	Vibrant, healthy appearance	Unhealthy appearance
Brightness, Radiance and Luminosity	Radiant, luminous, glowing appearance	Dull, matte and/or sallow
Skin Tone Evenness	Even, healthy skin color	Uneven, discolored, blotchy
Skin Tone Clarity	Clear appearance	Mottled, patchy appearance
PIH (Post-Inflammatory Hyperpigmentation)	None	Highly visible, deep color difference
Dark Spots and Age Spots (Intensity)	None, no color difference present	Intense, deep color difference (dark brown or tan)
Discoloration and Hyperpigmentation	Uniform, even appearance	Uneven, discolored, mottled pigmentation present
Complexion Health	Even, healthy color and surface texture, no blemishes	Blotchy, uneven surface texture, blemishes
Blackhead Severity	None	Numerous, severe

Hair and Scalp

Parameter	Positive anchor	Negative anchor
Hair Thickness and Fullness	Thick, full	Thin, limp
Vibrancy of Color	Vibrant, rich, reflective color	Dull and flat color
Hair Moisture and Dryness	Moisturized, hydrated hair	Brittle, dry hair
Combability (Ease of Styling)	Manageable, effortless to style	Unruly, difficult to style
Manageability (Ease of Styling)	Manageable, effortless to style	Unruly, difficult to style
Lack of Split Ends	No split ends, no splitting	Many split ends, severe splitting
Curl Definition	Highly defined curls from root to tip	Individual curls not perceptible
Springiness (Bounciness)	Airy, weightless appearance, high spring and bounce	Compressed, no spring or bounce
Hair Silkiness and Smoothness	Hair fibers aligned, smooth surface appearance and feel	Hair fibers not aligned, rough, coarse surface appearance and feel
Hair Shine	High gloss, luster	Dull, matte appearance
Hair Softness	Smooth, soft hair	Rough, coarse hair
Lack of Residue and Coating	No build up, clean hair	High build up, noticeable residue on hair
Detangling (Wet Hair)	Effortless pull through hair	Highly restricted pull through hair
Lack of Frizz	No frizz, sleek hair	High frizz, disordered hair
Curl Bounce	High spring, bounce and recoil of curls	Compressed, no spring or bounce of curls
Overall Healthy Hair Appearance	Healthy, lustrous hair appearance	Unhealthy, damaged hair appearance
Stiffness (Set, Not Soft)	Firm, holds shape, resilient	Soft, does not hold shape, not resilient
Weightlessness (Springiness)	Airy, weightless appearance, high spring and bounce	Compressed, no spring or bounce
Volume (Bulk, Thickness)	Thick, bulky, high elevation from skull and lateral displacement	Thin, closely follows shape of skull
Overall Scalp Health	Smooth, intact, even-toned appearance	Rough, flaking, plaques, cracked and/or reddened appearance

Appearance of Thinning Hair

Hair thinning is graded on the Savin scale for women and the Norwood scale for men.

Cosmetics and Makeup

Parameter	Positive anchor	Negative anchor
Overall Coverage of Product (Longwear, any product)	Excellent, uniform, even coverage	Poor, patchy coverage or no coverage
Product Creasing (shadow, foundation, concealer)	Smooth, no visible creasing or clumping	Highly visible creasing or clumping
Uniformity of Product Pigmentation (Coverage, any product)	Uniform, even coverage	Uneven, blotchy, mottled
Mascara Smudging	None	Highly visible product migration on skin around eyes
Mascara Flaking	No visible flaking	Highly visible flaking under and around eye
Lash Length	Long	Short
Lash Shine	Intense, deep shine	Dull, no shine present
Lash Thickness	Thick, full	Thin, skinny
Lash Volume	High, voluminous, dense lashes	Low, slight, thin lashes
Lipstick Bleeding	No bleeding or migration of product beyond lip	Severe bleeding, highly visible migration of product beyond lip
Lipstick Feathering	No feathering, clean definition of lipstick around lips	Severe feathering, lipstick highly visible in vertical lines around lip

Transfer and Smudge Resistance

Mascara example. About 15 minutes after the test product is applied to the eyelashes, a VCS technician swipes one eye once with a 4 x 4 gauze or cotton pad, using consistent pressure and a swift downward motion. The opposite eye is not swiped and serves as the control. Each eye is graded for color intensity and product migration after application and again after the swipe, and the pad is graded for color intensity. The five-point ordinal scales below are used, with half points as needed.

Color intensity: eyelashes and gauze

Grade	Description
0.0	No color present, weak intensity
1.0	Mild, faint color
2.0	Moderate color intensity, lacking homogeneity
3.0	Moderate to deep color intensity
4.0	Intense, deep, homogeneous color

Product migration: eyelashes

Grade	Description
0.0	No color present or severe migration
1.0	Severe migration
2.0	Moderate migration
3.0	Mild migration
4.0	Clean, no migration of product

Patch Residue

Grade	Description
0	None
1	Minimal, barely visible residue on patch
2	Mild but obvious residue visible on patch
3	Moderately obvious residue visible on patch
4	Severe, easily visible residue on patch

Waterproof Assay

About 15 minutes after application, the product site on one volar forearm is sprayed with water and the arm is rotated so the water runs off. The opposite arm stays dry.

Expert grading. Each test site is graded for color intensity and product migration after application and again after the water challenge.

Color transfer grading. Each test site is then blotted with gauze, and the color intensity on the gauze is graded to assess transfer. Three grades are recorded: post-application, post-water challenge, and post-water challenge after blotting. Where applicable, the water-challenged site is compared with the dry site.

Chromameter. Single Chromameter measurements are taken on each test site after application and after the water challenge, and Delta E is calculated to measure color loss. Delta E results are used together with the clinical grading to assess water resistance.

Color intensity: test sites and gauze

Grade	Description
0.0	No color present, weak intensity
1.0	Mild, faint color
2.0	Moderate color intensity, lacking homogeneity
3.0	Moderate to deep color intensity
4.0	Intense, deep, homogeneous color

Product migration: test sites

Grade	Description
0.0	No color present or severe migration
1.0	Severe migration
2.0	Moderate migration
3.0	Mild migration
4.0	Clean, no migration of product

Delta E result

Delta E	Result
0.0 to 1.9	Water or transfer proof
2.0 to 3.9	Water or transfer resistant
4.0 and up	Failure

Tolerance Grading

Objective tolerance is graded by the expert grader. Subjective tolerance is rated by the panelist.

Dryness (objective)

Grade	Description
0	None: smooth, no signs of dryness
1	Mild: slight but definite dryness, fine scales present, may have a powdery or ashy appearance
2	Moderate: mild flaking, some uplifting scales
3	Moderate to severe: peeling, flaking scales
4	Severe: evident and profuse flaking and very coarse scaling, cracking progressing to fissuring; erythema and/or edema may be present

Erythema (objective)

Grade	Description
0	No erythema
1	Very slight erythema (barely perceptible)
2	Well-defined erythema
3	Moderate to severe erythema
4	Severe erythema (beet redness) to slight eschar formation (injuries in depth)

Edema (objective)

Grade	Description
0	No edema
1	Very slight edema (barely perceptible)
2	Slight edema (edges of area well defined by definite raising)
3	Moderate edema (raised approximately 1 mm)
4	Severe edema (raised more than 1 mm and extending beyond area of exposure)

Subjective sensations (panelist rated)

Sensation	0	1	2	3
Stinging	None	Mild	Moderate	Severe
Tingling	None	Mild	Moderate	Severe
Itching	None	Mild	Moderate	Severe
Burning	None	Mild	Moderate	Severe